

PROPOSED
MINUTES OF THE
STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD MEETING

September 11, 2009, 10:00 A.M.
LAKE ERIE ROOM, MICHIGAN HISTORICAL CENTER
702 WEST KALAMAZOO STREET, LANSING, MICHIGAN

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Scott Beld, Lynn Evans, Richard Harms, Alison K. Hoagland, Elisabeth Knibbe, Carolyn Loeb

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Janese Chapman, Jennifer Radcliff, Ron Staley

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Amy Arnold, Laura Ashlee, Betty Boone, Nick Bozen, Bob Christensen, Sandra Clark, Brian Conway, Ted Grevstad-Nordbrock, Coffiann Hawthorne, Bryan Lijewski, Denise Sachau, Dan Schneider, Susan Sheppard, Diane Tuinstra, Todd Walsh

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PRESENT

Julia Carr, concerning Idlewild Historic District
Kenneth Carr, concerning Idlewild Historic District
Kristine Kidorf, concerning Michigan Bell and Western Electric Warehouse
Phil Manson, concerning Detroit Financial District
Elaine Robinson, concerning Idlewild Historic District
Sam Rogers, concerning Idlewild Historic District
Rebecca Savage, concerning Detroit Financial District
Veronica Smith, concerning Charles J. and Ingrid V. (Frendberg) Koebel House
William Thomas, concerning Wolcott Mill
Geraldine Walker, concerning Idlewild Historic District
George Walker, concerning Idlewild Historic District

Meeting called to order by Harms, 10:07 a.m.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Hoagland moved approval of agenda
Knibbe supported motion
Vote: 6-0

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Evans moved approval of minutes as presented

Hoagland supported motion

Vote: 6-0

STAFF REPORTS

Brian Conway, State Historic Preservation Office

- Governor has issued an executive order abolishing the Department of History, Arts and Libraries. Sandra Clark will discuss the executive order in more detail.
 - The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) will be moved to the Department of Energy, Labor, and Economic Growth (DELEG), and more specifically into the Michigan State Housing Development Authority (MSHDA).
 - MSHDA is recognized as the state's community development organization, so SHPO is a natural fit.
 - The executive director of MSHDA is supportive of historic preservation, and has an understanding of the work SHPO does.
- Several staff members have participated in workshops around the state since the last Review Board meeting, including Saint Joseph and Lake Orion.
- Robb McKay will be participating in an upcoming workshop in Kalamazoo.
- Bryan Lijewski will be participating in an upcoming tax credit workshop in Calumet, which is being sponsored by the National Park Service.
- Through the Certified Local Government program, SHPO sponsored a two-week window rehabilitation workshop in Kalamazoo.
 - The city of Kalamazoo partnered with the Michigan Historic Preservation Network (MHPN).
 - The program was aimed at training out-of-work carpenters in the skills and techniques of wooden window rehabilitation.
- Mount Clemens and Rochester Hills have been certified as Certified Local Governments.
- The selection for the tax credit program's special consideration credit has been made.
 - The allocation was awarded to the Accident Fund for the rehabilitation of the former Lansing Board of Water and Light Ottawa Street Station building.
- The first round of enhanced tax credit allocations have also been made. The projects selected include:
 - Argonaut Building, Detroit
 - Garfield Manor Apartments, Detroit
 - Crystal Inn, Crystal Falls
 - Scott Castle, Detroit

- Mack & Mack Building, Ypsilanti
 - Kerr Hardware Block, Coldwater
- The final round of enhanced tax credit allocations will occur in mid to late October.
- Mount Pleasant and Owosso are the newest Michigan Main Street communities.
- The Downtown Conference, sponsored by MSHDA, will be occurring soon. Several SHPO staff members will be speaking at various sessions.
- The Idlewild Historic District nomination being presented today is the final piece of Preserve America grant that was awarded to SHPO.
 - A driving/walking tour, a cultural resources management plan, and five Michigan Historical Markers were also completed as part of the grant.

Sandra S. Clark, Michigan Historical Center

- Executive Order (EO) 2009-36 brings a lot of changes to the SHPO as well as the Michigan Historical Center (MHC).
 - Records Management will be transferred to the Department of Management and Budget (DMB).
 - SHPO will be transferred to MSHDA. The SHPO is very much welcomed at MSHDA. Keith Molin, MSDHA Executive Director, is very familiar with SHPO. He is a former member of the Michigan Historical Commission, the Michigan History Foundation, and the Archives of Michigan Advisory Board.
 - Nick Bozen will be transferred to SHPO.
 - Archaeology will be transferred to MSHDA as part of SHPO, but certain functions will be transferred to the Department of Natural Resources (DNR).
 - A Memorandum of Agreement will be written that indicates the shared responsibility for the Office of the State Archaeologist (OSA).
 - The legal responsibility for OSA will be housed in DNR, and the personnel aspects of the OSA will be handled by MSHDA.
 - The Cultural Economic Development Office will also be transferred to MSHDA.
 - The Archives of Michigan and the Michigan Historical Museum System will be transferred to DNR.
 - Budgets for the various sections have not been established, but MSHDA intends to fund the sections it is receiving without general fund dollars.
 - All former MHC sections will remain in the Michigan Library and Historical Center building.
 - Collaboration and cooperation will continue as usual

- The Michigan History Foundation will continue to support the history functions of the state of Michigan.
- The EO also directs the Michigan History Magazine be removed from state government and be given to a non-profit organization.
- The EO further directs the Michigan Historical Marker program to be removed from state government, but because of its ties to various programs, the Marker program will likely be kept closer to state government than the Magazine.

Hoagland asked about the future of Clark. Clark responded that she will be transferred to DNR, and that she will be managing the museum and archives.

Harms asked what would happen to Michigan History Magazine employees once the transfer is completed. Clark replied that they will be receiving lay-off notices, and will not be employed by the state after October 1, 2009, unless they are employed in a different capacity.

Knibbe asked for clarification about SHPO's funding through MSHDA. Clark replied that SHPO will not be funded through MSHDA bond funds, but through the revenue earned through low-interest loans and other cash-flow revenue. Knibbe then asked if those funds could be used as federal match. Clark confirmed that the funds could be used as federal match. Knibbe then asked if SHPO would still be receiving its federal grant. Conway and Clark confirmed that SHPO would still receive those funds. Conway added that MSHDA administers a large portion of the state's Community Development Block Grant funds, which can also be used as match.

- SHPO would be working most closely with the Michigan Main Street Center and the Specialized Technical Assistance & Revitalization Strategy Division.
 - MSHDA is working hard to change its reputation from that of low-income housing providers to that of builders of neighborhoods and communities with a sense of place.
- The city of Detroit is working to restore Capitol Park, where a statue and the remains of Michigan's first Governor, Stevens T. Mason, are located. The park contains the site of Michigan's first capitol building. Through Michigan Historical Commissioner Jack Dempsey, the Michigan Historical Museum will be creating interpretive signage for that site.
 - Commissioner Dempsey is working to preserve the Grant House and other aspects of the state fairgrounds in Detroit.

NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

Site: Idlewild Historic District, Yates, Cherry Valley, and Pleasant Plains Townships, Lake County

Presented By: Robinson

Moved for Approval: Knibbe

Seconded: Loeb

Vote: 6-0

Criteria: A, B, C; ex. g

Level of Significance: National

Hoagland asked if the island identified on the map is actually an island. Robinson confirmed that it is an island, but it is currently surrounded by culverts. Robinson also added that the island is now called Williams Island. She further added that one component of the cultural resource plan is to replace the culverts with bridges to reopen the lake connections. Julia Carr spoke to the importance of Idlewild in Michigan's African American history. Rogers noted that most of the property surrounding the lake is still owned by the original families. Harms noted that traveling black baseball teams often stayed at Idlewild while playing in northern Michigan.

Site: Orchard Beach State Park

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Hoagland

Seconded: Evans

Vote: 6-0

Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: State

Evans noted that the summary of Michigan state parks should state that the transfer of Fort Mackinac was the first state park in Michigan, and that Michilimackinac was the second. Evans also noted that this applies to all three state park nominations.

Site: P. H. Hoefft State Park

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Evans

Seconded: Beld

Vote: 6-0

Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: Local

Site: Onaway State Park

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Hoagland

Seconded: Evans

Vote: 6-0
Criteria: A, C
Level of Significance: Local

Site: Wolcott Mill
Presented By: Christensen
Moved for Approval: Beld
Seconded: Knibbe
Vote: 6-0

Criteria: C
Level of Significance: Local

Harms asked whether water was used to turn the recently installed waterwheel. Christensen replied that to his knowledge, the waterwheel was not a working wheel. Thomas added the township has documentation that suggests Wolcott added a waterwheel after he purchased the mill, and though the current waterwheel is incorrectly placed, there is some significance in having the wheel in place. Hoagland asked if the horizontal waterwheels remained in the building. Thomas replied that the turbines do remain, and are located beneath the mill. Hoagland then asked if they were used to power the mill. Thomas replied that they are still used for power, along with electricity. Hoagland then asked if wheat was ground in the mill. Thomas responded that it was not ground in the mill, as it would present a significant cleaning problem.

Site: Charles J. and Ingrid V. (Frendberg) Koebel House
Presented By: Christensen
Moved for Approval: Knibbe
Seconded: Loeb
Vote: 6-0
Criteria: C

Level of Significance: National

Conway asked for clarification of the level of significance of the nomination. Christensen replied that the house was being nominated at state-level significance. Conway then asked if the house should be nominated at national-level significance due to its association with Eliel and Eero Saarinen. Knibbe added that the house is highly intact. Conway noted the national importance of the Saarinens.

Site: Detroit Financial District
Presented By: Savage
Moved for Approval: Evans
Seconded: Loeb
Vote: 5-0, Knibbe abstained
Criteria: A, B, C; ex. g
Level of Significance: State

Site: Michigan Bell and Western Electric Warehouse
Presented By: Kidorf
Moved for Approval: Knibbe
Seconded: Loeb
Vote: 6-0
Criteria: A, C
Level of Significance: Local

Site: Ludington Coast Guard Station
Presented By: Christensen
Moved for Approval: Loeb
Seconded: Hoagland
Vote: 6-0
Criteria: A
Level of Significance: Local

Conway asked why this nomination is not being submitted at state-level significance, adding that this site is one of the two largest United States Coast Guard (USCG) stations in Michigan, and exemplifies the pinnacle of USCG activity on the Great Lakes. Christensen replied that there are other complexes, such as in Frankfort, that are more intact than the station in Ludington. Knibbe added that the level of intactness impacts the level of significance. Christensen further added that the USCG operations from this station involved a small portion of the Lake Michigan coastline. Harms asked if this station was used as a supply station. Christensen responded that he found no evidence to suggest that it was used as such. Knibbe asked if there were plans to erect fencing between the buildings and the boat slips. Conway stated that full public access was allowed at this station.

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMITTEE STUDY REPORTS:

Presented by Amy Arnold

Earl Young Buildings Historic District, Charlevoix

The board had no additional comment.

Richter Brewery Historic District, Escanaba

The board had no additional comment.

Rickman House Historic District, Kalamazoo

The board had no additional comment.

Metropolitan Historic District, Kalamazoo

The board had no additional comment.

Elimination of the South Burdick Historic District, Kalamazoo

Hoagland asked if the property owners received historic preservation tax credits. Arnold replied that they did not. Knibbe asked if all of the buildings were demolished. Arnold replied that two of the buildings have already been demolished, and she expects that all of the buildings will eventually meet the same fate.

Downtown Greenville Historic District, Greenville

The board had no additional comment.

Helen Newberry Home Historic District, Detroit

The board had no additional comment.

Whittier Hotel Historic District, Detroit

Knibbe stated that the original landscaping has all been removed.

Hubbard's Annex to the National Park Historic District, Mackinac Island

Harms suggested that the W. Milliken cottage could be considered contributing if it was the original building.

LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPEALS

Presented by Nick Bozen

Phil Belfy v. East Lansing Historic District Commission

Harms noted that, in the past, the Board has required two weeks to consider appeal information. He further noted that, while the necessary information was received in time for the meeting, it was not submitted before the two week time period.

Therefore the Board must decide whether or not to consider the appeal at this meeting, or table consideration until the January 2010 meeting. Hoagland moved that the Board consider the appeal at the current meeting. ____?____ supported the motion. The motion passed 5 to 1, with Knibbe voting against hearing the appeal today.

Hoagland moved the Review Board accept the Proposal for Decision as written.

Evans seconded the motion. Vote: 6-0.

DATE OF NEXT MEETING

January 15, 2009

ADJOURNMENT

Harms adjourned the meeting at 12:22 p.m.

Prepared by T. Walsh